

10/23/10

NOTES

Shows hierarchy of writing

Shows way of life

Number of different labels vs how to show value

- ① Compare the seal of an early cave drawing
 - diff tools
 - diff meanings - religion vs observations
 - how technology improved

↓
Diff value the ball

- ② Why some agriculture societies that didn't develop into larger.

- diff terrain & climate
- no trade = no technology
- no support for bigger population
- physical barriers

↓
Not enough population

←
Diamond left out a lot of crops - he chose things that fit to his ideas

- ③ According to Diamond, why major societies have advantage

• technology ~~technology~~

- latitude/longitude
- tries to be science based but just pulls stuff

↓
Some arguments are fact but some are hard to believe

- ④ How conscious choice - to what extent?

- tools - agriculture
- UNCONSCIOUS: food resource - forced to

↓
change crops readily available for some societies

- ⑤ Compare Egypt & Mes. China & Indus

- hierarchical societies
- by rivers

↓
writing systems

- ⑥ Why do some scholars - ~~the~~ horseman of Apocalypse

- competition led to warfare
- agriculture - destroyed natural environment

CRITIQUES

Tomlinson: • not very persuasive
• critiquing a book in a diff area than he is in
• less bias? ~~more~~

McNeill: • Diamond thinks its all about environment
• liked book but had some opposing ideas
• gentle criticism
• talked more of ultimate vs proximate

Eprey: • attacked it too much
• almost too much
• went to far

• They all had similar view pts though
• look at book as a whole
• broad views

To what extent can someone critique?
• can't just trust b/c professor tells you to read it
• just b/c its a book doesn't mean its real
• a way to get another opinion

Diamond as primary source
• people would know he's American

Diamond Debate

To what extent does Diamond's environmentally based argument persuasively answer the question of global inequalities?

For: • valid argument b/c uses examples
• may be wrong to put environment so high
but it does have an affect

Against: • humans shape lands w/ agriculture
• he omitted some places (Australia)
• contradicts himself?
• people overcome things such as
climate - levels it off